

Wixted, John Timothy, Review of Burton Watson, *The Old Man Who Does As He Pleases* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1973), in *Journal of the American Oriental Society* 96.2 (Apr.-June 1976), pp. 340-343.
[Fangweng 放翁 = Lu You 陸游]

not a vocabulary of common meanings, prove helpful in reading other plays. There is also an extensive bibliography an Old Mandarin and the language of Yüan drama that will prove useful to everyone, including the specialist.

In sum, this is an essential book for the student of Yüan drama, no matter at what stage his development. Instructive of method as well as of content, the work provides a sturdy bridge from textbook to research materials. It should become a standard work in the field, and with minor improvements, it will serve as an excellent model for advanced readers in other literary genres.

STEPHEN H. WEST

UNIVERSITY OF ARIZONA

The Old Man Who Does As He Pleases: Selections from the Poetry and Prose of Lu Yu. Translated by BURTON WATSON. Pp. xxii + 126, 1 map. New York and London: COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY PRESS. 1973. \$6.95.

Ezra Pound calls the three constitutive elements of poetry "phanopoeia," "logopoeia," and "melopoeia"; these are, namely, the casting of images upon the visual imagination, the dance of the intellect among words, and the charging of words with the properties of music. The first is said to be translatable; the second, untranslatable, can only be approximated; and the third is beyond translation. In this light, Burton Watson's recreation of sixty-three poems by Lu Yu is well deserving of praise.

Annotation to the poems is sparse. Introductory material has been kept to a bare minimum. And reader aids, like a finding-list for the poems or a detailed map of identifiable place names in the diary section, are absent. This doubtless reflects a conscious attempt to let the texts speak for themselves.

Many of Watson's translations read extremely well. I would count among these #36 and #40, two of the finest poems of social criticism by Lu, and #46, #52-#54, and #60-#62, which illustrate Lu's superlative skill at depicting village scenes. Watson also does as well as one could hope with some of Lu's patriotic verse, e.g., #58. (Note: references are to poem—, not page-number. Cf. list below.) Indeed some lines are rendered brilliantly:

'Steering his plow, ambling the bright water,/ . . . '

#50

'(Ancient compositions) muffled by a thousand years—' #34

'Who put me astride this horse, a visitor to the shining capital?' #29

Yet in the face of this real accomplishment, I do have misgivings. For one, the majority of the first twenty poems strike me as being jerky, somehow lacking the natural flow of the original. I think comparison with

Watson's translations of Lu Yu in the *Introduction to Sung Poetry* is instructive here. In the earlier work he translates the individual line as the basic syntactic unit, usually turning it into full grammatical English. In the work under review, he has pared down the line, omitting connectives and all but the most specific semantic references, while making the couplet the dominant syntactic unit. This is more in keeping with Chinese poetic practice and it represents a laudable attempt on the translator's part to experiment with his own verse forms. Unfortunately, I do not think the results are as successful as his skillful renderings in the *Sung poetry work* or in his very fine volume of *Su Tung-p'o translations*. Watson, like Pound, is trying to search out a more effective way of charging words. Yet, the use in English of selected features of Chinese verse structure can make a re-created poem's images and transitions more disconnected than they ought to be. With poets noted for their natural-flowing, seemingly conversational style—like Lu Yu or Mei Yao-ch'en—this can be harmful. Too much juncture can have the added disadvantage of distracting reader attention from other relationships in the poem and perhaps contributes here to my general impression of an overly folksy *Old Man Who Does As He Pleases*.

Another reservation I have concerns the problem of allusion and its (non-)translation or (non-)annotation. Lu Yu's poetry presents less of a problem in this regard than that, say, of Tu Fu or Yüan Hao-wen. As Tai Fuku said of Lu, "Using what is plain and simple he fashioned subtle lines; / Taking the most ordinary words, he changed them into wonders" (Watson, tr., *Sung Poetry*, 158). Yet Lu does employ allusions. At times they are incorporated into the text in a totally unobtrusive way (l.13#8 *Ch'u tz'u*; l.6 #26 Tu Fu; l.6 #35 Han Yü). At other times, for purposes of balance and contrast, they are meant to be recognized as allusions (l.3 #52). Lu Yu enjoys the play of giving a song title or famous poem title—virtual colloquialisms—full literal meaning (last lines #6 & #31). Occasionally Buddhist terminology is used (l.4 #21). A scholarly reference could be made for purposes of tone, import, and contrast (l.14 #31 Han Yü). In the hands of Lu Yu allusions can be common and still effective (l.1 #17 T'ao Ch'ien) or hackneyed and less successful (l.11-12 #42 *Shang shu* & Wang Wei).

The reader is told nothing of this. Watson, who is well aware of the problem, follows his usual practice, not wishing to burden the reader with references to a potential welter of names and texts. Yet Lu Yu, precisely because his allusions are within bounds, could well be the subject of fuller treatment, with little loss of interest in the text itself—indeed, with enhanced appreciation of it.

Partly because they present less of a problem in this respect, I most admire Watson's translations of the poems of farm and village life that dominate Lu's later writing. Ikkai Tomoyoshi has pointed out the cumulative effect of these poems. I would like to see Watson's corpus of Lu Yu translations expanded to two- or three-hundred. The present volume (with many shorter poems) represents less than 1% of the poet's more than 9300 *shih* poems.

There are specific points where I might wish to modify the translation, mostly questions of tone or turn-of-phrase in English. These are, for the most part, minor.

The excerpts from Lu's *Diary of a Trip to Shu* are pleasant to read. The scenic description is handled well. There are many points of interesting detail. Unfortunately, no attempt is made in the book's introductory remarks to place the work in reference to other Chinese writing of the sort; nor is mention made of the author's other prose work.

The Lu Yu volume is a handsome one. Regrettably, it has no finding-list. The following is provided for reader convenience:

	I	II	III	IV	V	VI
#1	1	1.7	42		62	B6, C198, Fb44
#2	2	1.12	46	4	70	B8, Fb45, M5
#3	3	1.22	54	8	98	B10, C199, Fb50, K194, L69, M6, N46, P365, X72
#4	4	2.32	67		118	Fb56, N38
#5	5	2.33	68			
#6	6	2.36	70	10	131	
#7	7	3.57			165	
#8	8	3.60	81		177	B28, D16
#9	9	3.66	84	19	195	A85, B31, C200, D18 Fb164, K195, L69, M21 N43, P366, X73, Y211
#10	10	3.74	85			B32, D19, M22
#11	11	4.95			263	
#12	13	5.7			287	
#13	14	5.17		24	310	
#14	16	7.51			392	
#15	17	8.69		33		A81, B64, D49, E26, L73, M52, N32, T283, X75
#16	18	8.78	108		433	D53, Fa61
#17	19	9.99	112	43		S255, U121, V102, W153
#18	20	10.4	114	44	520	B79, E33, Fb157
#19	21	10.9	116	46	535	B80, D65, M79
#20	22	11.26	124		561	
#21	23	12.67			581	
#22	24	13.84		53		B94, C206, D76, K200, M99, N58, W156
#23	24	13.84	132	55		B94, C206, D76, K201, M99
#24	25	13.97			610	
#25	26	14.24	142	58		G279, K202, M116
#26	28	15.28	145			Fa19, H40
#27	29	17.78	160			
#28	30	17.85	161			
#29	31	17.89	168	64		B113, C207, D98, Fb44, K208, L76, M126
#30	32	18.8		66		
#31	33	19.45		68		M129
#32	34	19.49	178			
#33	36	21.72	180			

#34	37	24.18	189			
#35	39	26.52	195	80		Fa115, G290, M146
#36	40	27.69		83		B137, M149
#37	42	28.88		88		
#38	43	28.92	200		807	D121
#39	44	30.31			822	
#40	45	32.53		94		M165
#41	46	32.61	214			
#42	47	36.20	224			
#43	48	37.40		100		M180
#44	49	37.47	228	102	919	
#45	50	45.76	242			T285, W166
#46	51	47.10			990	
#47	52	50.51	248	109	1007	M201
#48	55	50.54		118	1018	
#49	56	50.58		120	1020	
#50	57	53.101		123		
#51	57	53.102		125		
#52	58	54.14	267	126	1037	B185, M205
#53	59	58.82		134		
#54	60	59.84	273	135		
#55	61	61.15	277	136		Fb199
#56	62	63.50	281	138		B194, M219
#57	63	63.61	282			
#58	64	77.50	298		1108	D176, Fa102, M242
#59	65	78.67		151	1113	
#60	66	78.73				
#61	66	78.73				
#62	67	79.88				
#63	68	85.86	309	159	1142	A89, B205, C215, D180, E219, G298, J216, K216, L80, M248, N25, Q204, R117, T286, X79, Y210.
I	Watson pg. no.					
II	Chien-nan shih kao, Lu Fang-weng chi (Kuo-hsüeh chi-pen ts'ung-shu, Basic Sinological Series) Shanghai, 1933.					
III	Maeno Naoki, Riku Yü, Kanshi taikai series #19, Tokyo, 1964.					
IV	Ikkai Tomoyoshi, Riku Yü, Chügoku shijin senshü, 2d series #8, Tokyo, 1962.					
V	Suzuki Torao, Riku Hōo shikai, 3 vols., Tokyo, 1950-54.					
VI						
A	Ch'eng Ch'ien-fan and Miao K'un, Sung shih hsüan chu, Shanghai, 1961.					
B	Chi Feng, Lu Fang-weng shih tz'u hsüan Chekiang, 1958.					
C	Ch'ien Chung-shu, Sung shih hsüan chu, Peking, 1958.					
D	Chu Tung-jun, Lu Yu hsüan chi, Shanghai, 1962.					
E	Hsü Wen-ch'i, Fang-weng kuo-nan shih hsüan, Shanghai, 1933.					
F	Huang I-chih, Lu Yu shih, Taipei, n.d. (Pagination in two parts—indicated as Fa and Fb.)					
G	Iritani Sensuke, Sōshi sen, Tokyo, 1967.					
H	Kawakami Hajime, Riku Hōo kanshō, 2 vols., Kyoto, 1949. (Vol. 2 unavailable to reviewer.)					
J	Ku-chin wen-hsüan (Kuo-yü jih-pao), Vol. I (Sect. 46), Taipei, 1957.					
K	Ogawa Tamaki, Sōshi sen, Tokyo, 1967.					
L	Sung shih i-pai shou (Chung-hua shu-chü) Shanghai, 1959.					
M	Yu Kuo-en and Li I, Lu Yu shih hsüan, Peking, 1957.					
N	Candlin, Clara M. The Rapier of Lu, London, 1946.					

- P Demiéville, Paul, *Anthologie de la poésie chinoise classique*, Paris, 1962.
- Q Guillermaz, Patricia, *La Poésie chinoise*, Paris, 1957.
- R Liu, Shih-shun, *One Hundred and One Chinese Poems*, Hong Kong, 1968.
- S Margouliès, G. *Anthologie raisonnée de la littérature chinoise*, Paris, 1948.
- T Pai, Chwen-yu, Lu Yu translations in Robert Payne, ed., *The White Pony*, New York (1947) 1960 ed.
- U Rexroth, Kenneth, *One Hundred Poems from the Chinese*, New York, n.d.
- V Rexroth, Kenneth, *Love and the Turning Year (One Hundred More Poems from the Chinese)*, New York, 1970.
- W Roy, Claude, *Trésor de la poésie chinoise*, Paris, 1967.
- X Yang, Hsien-yi and Gladys Yang, Lu Yu translations in *Chinese Literature*, 8/1963.
- Y Bertuccioli, Giuliano. *La Letteratura cinese*, Milan, 1960.

Note also the following Western-language material on Lu Yu:

Tsung Shu, "Lu Yu, Poet and Patriot," *Chinese Literature* 8/1963, pp. 80-88.

Revue bibliographique de sinologie summaries: Vol. III (1957) #605; Vol. IV (1958) #693; Vol. VI (1960) #483; Vol. VII (1961) #472, #530 & #531; Vol. VIII (1962) #600, #601, #621 & #622.

Journal of Chinese Literature (Chūgoku bungaku hō) English summaries: Vol. 17 (1962), p. viii & Vol. 17 (1962), p. ix.

Ho Peng Yoke, Goh Thean Chye, and Beda Lim. *Lu Yu, The Poet-Alchemist*. Occasional Paper 13, Faculty of Asian Studies, The Australian National University (Canberra, 1972).

Ch'ien Chung-shu, "Critical Notice: Clara M. Candlin, *The Rapiar of Lu*," *Philobiblon* 3 (Dec., 1946), pp. 40-49.

Duke, Michael S., Abstract of thesis in progress: "The Life and Works of Lu Yu (1125-1209)," University of California, Berkeley, *Sung Studies Newsletter* 9 (June, 1974), 40-41.

J. T. WIXTED